Acute and chronic effects from pulse exposure of D. magna to silver and copper oxide nanoparticles

Sørensen, Sara Nørgaard; Lützhøft, Hans-Christian Holten; Rasmussen, Rose; Baun, Anders

Published in:
Aquatic Toxicology

Link to article, DOI:
10.1016/j.aquatox.2016.10.004

Publication date:
2016

Document Version
Peer reviewed version

Link back to DTU Orbit

Citation (APA):
Title
Acute and chronic effects from pulse exposure of *D. magna* to silver and copper oxide nanoparticles

Authors and affiliations
Sara Nørgaard Sørensen, Hans-Christian Holten Lützhøft, Rose Rasmussen and Anders Baun
Department of Environmental Engineering, Technical University of Denmark, Building 115, DK-2800 Kgs. Lyngby, Denmark

Corresponding author
Name: Sara Nørgaard Sørensen
Address: Department of Environmental Engineering
Technical University of Denmark
Bygningstorvet, Building 115
DK-2800 Kgs. Lyngby, Denmark
Phone: +45 45251688 or +45 28556482
Fax: +45 45932850
E-mail: sans@env.dtu.dk
ABSTRACT

Aquatic toxicity testing of nanoparticles (NPs) is challenged by their dynamic behavior in test suspensions. The resulting difficulties in controlling and characterizing exposure concentrations are detrimental to the generation of concentration-response data needed for hazard identification of NPs. This study explores the applicability of short-term (1, 2 and 3 h) pulse exposures as means to keep the exposure stable and at the same time disclose acute and chronic effects of AgNPs and CuONPs in D. magna. Dissolution, agglomeration and sedimentation were found to have less influence on exposure concentrations during 1-3 h pulses than for 24-48 h continuous exposures. For AgNPs, preparation of test suspensions in medium 24 h before toxicity testing (aging) increased stability during the short-term pulses. In pulse tests, organisms were exposed to the test materials AgNPs and CuONPs for 1, 2 and 3 h, and afterwards transferred to clean medium and observed for 48 h (post-exposure period) for acute effects and for 21 d for chronic effects. AgNO₃ and CuCl₂ were used as reference materials for dissolved silver and copper, respectively. For all test materials, a 3 h pulse caused comparable immobility in D. magna (observed after 48 h post-exposure) as 24 h continuous exposure, as evidenced by overlapping 95% confidence intervals of EC₅₀-values. In the 21 d post-exposure period, no trends in mortality or body length were identified. AgNPs and AgNO₃ pulses had no effect on the number of moltings, days to first live offspring or cumulated number of offspring, but the number of offspring increased for AgNPs (3 h pulse only). In contrast, CuONPs and CuCl₂ pulses decreased the number of moltings and offspring, and for CuONPs the time to first live offspring was prolonged. After CuONP exposures, the offspring production decreased more with increasing concentrations than for CuCl₂ exposures when taking the measured dissolved copper into account. This indicates a nanoparticle-specific effect for CuONPs, possible related CuONPs accumulated in the gut of D. magna during the pulse exposure. Pulse exposure is an environmentally relevant exposure scenario for NPs, which for AgNPs and CuONPs enables more stable exposures and cause acute immobility of D. magna comparable to continuous 24 h exposures. Pulse exposure is likely relevant and applicable for other toxic and dissolving metal NPs, but this requires further research.
Keywords

Nanecotoxicology * Pulse exposure * Hazard identification * Exposure control * Endpoints
Within recent decades, engineered nanoparticles (ENPs) have been increasingly produced and used in products already available on the market. Silver nanoparticles (AgNPs) are the most commonly applied of ENPs, utilized mainly for antimicrobial purposes in various product categories (Hansen et al., 2016; SCENIHR, 2014). However, the use of other metal NPs, such as CuO, for biocidal purposes is also increasing (Brinch et al., 2016). Efforts to determine potential environmental hazards of ENPs within various regulatory schemes rely on the use of standard aquatic toxicity tests, which have been developed and utilized for hazard identification of soluble chemicals. However, standardized ecotoxicity testing of ENPs is challenged by poor reproducibility, altered concentration-response patterns, and occurrence of physical effects resulting from mechanical interference of the ENPs with the test system, endpoint or organism (Handy et al., 2012a; Hartmann et al., 2013, 2010; Petersen et al., 2014; Sørensen et al., 2015). A critical issue in this regard is the assumption of complete solubility and stability of the test chemical during incubation. This assumption is violated when ENPs are tested, as they by definition suspend in aqueous media rather than dissolve, and furthermore exhibit highly dynamic behavior, i.e. change their physical appearance both spatially and temporally (Handy et al., 2012b; Petersen et al., 2014; Sørensen and Baun, 2015; Sørensen et al., 2015).

The freshwater crustacean Daphnia magna is commonly used for standardized toxicity testing of 24–48 h acute immobility and 21-days chronic effects regarding reproduction, growth and mortality (OECD, 2012, 2004). Daphnids have high ecological relevance and a relatively short life-cycle that enables chronic studies within a practical and reasonable testing timeframe of 21 days, in addition to being easily managed in the laboratory. Generally, far less studies in the scientific literature focus on the chronic effects of ENPs in D. magna as opposed to acute effects, although the importance and relevance of investigating chronic effects of ENPs have been pinpointed (Wang et al., 2015; Zhao and Wang, 2011). One reason is likely that chronic tests are more labor and cost intensive,
especially for ENPs, as prolonged exposure magnify the efforts and logistics needed to monitor and
maintain stable exposure conditions (Handy et al., 2012a). The test suspensions in chronic tests with
*D. magna* are usually renewed every second to third day, to keep the exposure concentration stable,
ensure sufficient amounts of nutrients and remove waste products. For ENPs, small changes to the
stock preparation procedure may influence the prepared suspensions (Hartmann et al., 2015) and
compromise the repeatability and reproducibility of the renewal steps. For the ENPs that undergo
dissolution, such as AgNPs and CuONPs the issue of unstable exposure scenarios becomes further
complicated by the dissolution kinetics. Also, the necessity of feeding during a chronic test becomes
an influencing factor, as the feeding conditions have shown to influence the chronic effects of
AgNPs to *D. magna* (Mackeviča et al., 2015).

Short-term exposures in *D. magna* identified as “pulse” or “intermittent” exposures have been
applied for toxicity testing of both organic and inorganic substances, with the effects being
monitored immediately after or during a post-exposure period in clean media after the pulse
(Andersen et al., 2006; Hoang and Klaine, 2008; Trac et al., 2015). Pulse toxicity tests have been
applied mainly to simulate a more environmentally realistic and relevant exposure scenario, as
many chemical pollutants are discharged into aquatic environments as “pulses” resulting from e.g.
surface runoff after rain events, overflow of wastewater treatment plants, agrochemicals and
veterinary pharmaceuticals from agriculture (e.g. Handy, 1994; Hommen et al., 2010). Furthermore,
agrochemicals with a short half-life in the environment have also been suggested to exhibit pulse-
like exposures (Reinert et al., 2002). Analogously, ENPs are also expected to rapidly transform
from their pristine form, due to for example dissolution, agglomeration, sedimentation, and coating
alterations once discharged into the environment (Lowry et al., 2014) or even when added to
simplified media in laboratory toxicity tests (Petersen et al., 2014). A study of stream mesocosms
has found the fate of cerium oxide ENPs to differ for press and pulse exposures and the authors
recommend environmental risk assessment of ENPs to address the implications of exposure
duration (Baker et al., 2016). To date, several studies have investigated the chronic effects in
crustaceans exposed to ENPs of silver (Blinova et al., 2013; Gaiser et al., 2011; Mackevica et al., 2015; Pokhrel and Dubey, 2012; Seitz et al., 2015; Zhao and Wang, 2011), TiO$_2$ (Seitz et al., 2013), ZnO (Adam et al., 2014; Zhao et al., 2012), and CuO (Adam et al., 2015; Rossetto et al., 2014; Zhao et al., 2012). These studies focus on a variety of influencing factors such as feeding conditions, exposure routes, exposure scenarios (semi-static vs. flow-through), mixture effects, ENP characteristics (e.g. size, agglomeration, coating), environmental factors (e.g. pH, media, dissolved organic matter) and effects of ENPs vs. released ions. However, to our knowledge, the influence of exposure duration, in terms of a short-term NP pulse, and the following acute and chronic effect to *D. magna* remains unexamined.

The aim of this study is to explore the applicability of a short-term pulse exposure to reveal acute and chronic effects of Ag and CuONPs to *D. magna*. We exposed neonate *D. magna* to 1, 2 and 3 h pulse exposures to AgNPs, CuONPs, silver nitrate (AgNO$_3$) and copper chloride (CuCl$_2$) and studied the acute (immobility) and chronic effects (mortality, body length, molting and reproduction) occurring within 48 h and 21 d post-exposure periods, respectively. The obtained responses were then compared to those of continuous exposures in acute and chronic tests with the same materials. Pulsed exposure presents an environmentally relevant exposure scenario and may also facilitate more stable exposure conditions for ENPs during testing. As the transformation processes of suspended ENPs are time-dependent, we expected less impact of such processes during a short-term pulse, than during 24 or 48 h continuous exposure applied for standard acute tests. Therefore, the stability of the test suspensions in terms of agglomeration, dissolution and sedimentation of AgNPs and CuONPs was monitored over the course of the pulse (1-3 h) and continuous (48 h) exposures.
2. Materials and Methods

2.1 Media, chemicals and preparation of suspensions

Citrate stabilized AgNPs were purchased from Cline Scientific AB (Gothenburg, Sweden) as an aqueous suspension of 20 mg Ag/L in Milli-Q water containing < 0.005% Tannic acid and < 0.05% Trisodium citrate dehydrate. The reported silver content was confirmed by inductively coupled plasma – optical emission spectrometry (Varian Vista-MPX CCD simultaneous ICP-OES). The primary size determined by Transmission Electron Microscopy (TEM) for the delivered suspension is 29.9 ± 4.5 nm (data provided by the manufacturer). CuO nanopowder of average size ≤ 50 nm (TEM) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich. Silver nitrate (≥99.0%, Sigma-Aldrich) and copper(II) chloride, dihydrate (98%, Acros Organics) were included as soluble silver and copper controls.

Elendt M7 medium (OECD, 2012) with modifications, was used for D. magna cultivation and toxicity testing (composition provided in SI, Table S1).

AgNP test suspensions were prepared by diluting the purchased suspension with medium, without stirring/sonication. Suspensions were prepared in volumetric flasks and, for the pulse tests, stored in the dark at 20 °C for 24 hours prior to toxicity testing. This “aging” step was conducted to have the initial rapid dissolution of silver ions into medium occur before rather than during toxicity testing, in accordance with previous work (Sørensen and Baun, 2015). For the toxicity test with continuous exposure, AgNP suspensions were prepared fresh, as prescribed by the ISO protocol (ISO, 1989).

CuONP suspensions were prepared immediately prior to testing as the aging step markedly decreased toxicity. This decreased toxicity was likely due to adhesion of CuONPs to container walls at the suspension surface during the aging steps after the aging step, large colored stains was visible on containers in the initial range finding tests (data not shown). CuO nanopowder were dispersed in Milli-Q water and probe sonicated (Branson Digital Sonifier Model S-250D) in an ice cooled beaker for 5 min at 10% amplitude. Polypropylene flasks and beakers were applied, as this lead to greatest recoveries of Cu (data not shown).
2.2 Characterization of test suspensions

The total silver and copper concentrations were determined by ICP-MS (Agilent 7700, Agilent, Santa Clara, CA, USA), and for some silver samples ICP-OES (Varian Vista-MPX CCD simultaneous ICP-OES). Measurements were conducted for all test concentrations prior to toxicity testing and for the highest test concentrations after ended pulse exposures. Samples were added concentrated HNO₃ to a concentration of 17% (AgNPs) and 6.2% (CuONPs) and digested for 24 hours at 20 °C in the dark, then diluted with de-ionized water and kept in the dark at 4 °C until analysis.

The particle size distribution, hydrodynamic diameter and zeta potential of NP suspensions were determined by Dynamic Light Scattering (DLS) using a Malvern ZetaSizer Nano ZS (Malvern Instruments, UK). Measurements were conducted on 1 mL sample in standard disposable cuvettes (or capillary cells for zeta potential determinations) at 25 °C with a scattering angle of 173 °. Suspensions were characterized immediately upon preparation, and at the beginning and end of toxicity test exposures.

The degree of sedimentation in CuONP suspensions over time was assessed in suspensions of 1.3 and 20 mg Cu/L. Carefully, without stirring the suspensions, a sample for ICP analysis was drawn after the pulse exposures (1, 2 and 3 hours) from the middle of the suspension. Then suspensions were stirred and another sample was drawn to yield the suspended and total Cu concentrations, respectively.

The concentration of dissolved Ag and Cu from NP suspensions in medium was determined by ultracentrifugation (Beckman L8-60M). Briefly, suspensions of AgNP (10, 50 and 200 µg Ag/L nominal) and CuONP (0.2, 2 and 20 mg Cu/L nominal) were prepared in medium and kept in the dark at 20 °C, similar to the exposure conditions of toxicity testing and aging. Duplicate samples of
10 mL were drawn from each suspension at times reflecting the pulse and continuous exposure durations (and for AgNPs also the aging step before testing); For CuONPs at 0, 1, 2, 3, 24 and 48 hours and for AgNPs at 0, 24, 25, 26, 27, and 48 h. The samples were centrifuged for 30 min (AgNPs) and 45 min (CuONPs) at 30000 rpm (~68000 × g) to ensure settling of particles according to their sizes (based on calculations derived from Stoke’s law and material density). The supernatant (5 mL) was collected, digested with HNO₃ and the Ag and Cu concentration determined by ICP-MS. Speciation of Ag and Cu from AgNO₃ and CuCl₂ in modified M7 was estimated by the chemical speciation modeling program Visual MINTEQ 3.0 (Gustafsson, 2010), assuming equilibrium with atmospheric CO₂.

2.3 Acute toxicity tests

Acute immobilization tests were conducted with 48 hours continuous exposure in accordance with OECD Guideline (OECD, 2004). Immobility was recorded after 24 and/or 48 hours. Furthermore, the study included a series of tests with single pulse exposures of 1, 2 and 3 hours, followed by a 48 h post-exposure observation period in clean medium. All tests included a control and five exposure concentrations with four replicates, each comprised of five neonates (<24 h old) in 25 mL test suspension contained in 100 ml beakers. All exposures and post-exposure incubations were carried out at 20 ± 2 °C in the dark. For the pulse tests, daphnids were rinsed in medium at the end of the exposure time and then transferred to beakers with clean medium for the 48 h post-exposure period. Immobility was recorded immediately upon transfer (0 hours) and after 24 and 48 hours. An overview of applied concentration ranges for the toxicity tests are given in Table 1. The pH of all test concentrations remained within 7.7-8.9 during exposure and post-exposure. The validity criteria were met for all acute tests, with no control mortalities and an oxygen content > 9 mg/L.

2.4 Chronic toxicity tests
The chronic toxicity following a single pulse exposure to the test materials was investigated over a 205 21 days post-exposure observation period. The tests were carried out in accordance with OECD guideline (OECD, 2012), however all organisms were kept in clean media throughout the observation period. Ten neonate daphnids (< 24 h old) was exposed in a 100 mL beaker containing 50 mL test suspension (or medium for the controls) in the dark at 20 ± 2 °C. The exposure concentration ranges (Table 1) were based on the outcome of the acute toxicity tests, to target a maximum 10% lethality.

Upon pulse exposures, the ten neonates in each exposure group were rinsed shortly in medium and transferred to ten separate beakers of 50 mL medium for the 21-d post-exposure period. During the post-exposure, daphnids were kept in the climate controlled room, also used for the general cultivation of D. magna, at 20 ± 2 °C with a 16:8 h light:dark cycle. Daphnids were daily fed a concentrated algal suspension (P. subcapitata) of 10^7 - 10^8 cells/mL, as determined by cell counting (Z2 Coulter Counter, Beckman CoulterTM). The amount of algal suspension added, was calculated to give a feeding rate of 1 × 10^7 cells/daphnid/day, which according to reported carbon content of P. subcapitata corresponds to 0.1 mg C/daphnid/day (Halling-Sørensen et al., 1996). Every third day, daphnids were transferred to a clean beakers with fresh medium and the pH and oxygen content of the old media was measured. Endpoints included mortality, molting of carapace, growth, days to first offspring and cumulative number of live and dead offspring. Daphnids were monitored daily to note mortality, molting and the number of live and dead offspring produced (offspring was removed and discarded during counting). The body length of daphnids was measured after 21 days from microscope images of the daphnids using QCapture Pro 6.0 image and analysis software.

2.5 Data treatment and statistical analyses

The measured Cu concentration in suspensions of CuONPs and CuCl\textsubscript{2} was 95 ± 10% of the nominal (average and standard deviation), thus nominal Cu concentrations were applied for data treatment. For AgNO\textsubscript{3} and AgNP suspensions, the average silver recovery was 69 ± 21% of the nominal concentrations. The lower AgNO\textsubscript{3} concentrations (0.2-8 µg Ag/L) were bordering the lower limit of
the ICP-MS calibration curve (1 µg Ag/L), which may have influenced the recoveries. For AgNPs, incomplete acid digestion of AgNPs prior to ICP-MS analysis may be the cause, but since 100% silver was recovered from the undiluted suspension (as received from the supplier) this must relate to interactions with medium components and/or dilution/transfer steps. Low recoveries of AgNPs in M7 medium is previously reported, even when including sorption to glass walls (Cupi et al., 2015). Due to these analytical uncertainties and because the scope of this study is to compare the effects following continuous and pulse exposure, rather than determining actual toxic levels of silver and copper, the nominal concentrations are applied for data treatment.

For acute immobility responses, the program TOXCALC™ v5.0 (Tidepool Scientific) was used to estimate mean effective concentrations (EC$_{50}$) and 95% confidence intervals by linear regression on probit transformed data using maximum likelihood estimation for the point estimation. The chronic endpoints including body length, number of moltings, days to first live offspring, and total number of live offspring are provided for each replicate mother organism surviving the 21 days post-exposure. The chronic data from exposure groups of various concentration and pulse duration were checked for normal distribution (D'Agostin & Pearson normality test) and homogeneity of variances (Bartlett’s and Levene’s test). In most cases, one or both criteria were not met, even after rank-transformation, and as result one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) was not applied to compare treatments. Instead, linear regression was applied to identify trends in responses with increasing test material concentration (slope ≠ 0, p < 0.05), and to compare if responses of 1, 2 and 3 h pulses differ significantly (slopes of 1, 2 and 3 h data differs, p < 0.05). Deviation from linearity was checked by Runs tests, and was not confirmed for any of the data sets.
3. Results and discussion

3.1 Characterization and stability of test suspensions

Although the recovery of silver generally was low (i.e. the transfer from stock suspension to tested concentrations in medium), no substantial loss of silver occurred over time during the 24 h aging of AgNPs in medium or during the pulse exposures. The silver concentrations measured in AgNP suspensions (200 µg Ag/L) before and after aging, and after pulses were all in the range 53-64%. The samples for ICP-OES analysis were drawn from suspensions without stirring, thus data indicates no substantial sedimentation of AgNPs, and no visible sedimentation or other changes in the appearance of suspensions was observed over 48 hours. According to DLS measurements, the size distribution of AgNPs in medium (200 µg Ag/L) was monodisperse with a single size peak and a polydispersity index (PDI) in the range of 0.14-0.39 for all measurements. The size of AgNPs increased during the 24 h aging step prior to exposure, but then remained relatively stable during the following 1-3 hour pulses, see Figure 1A.

The zeta potential of the suspensions was at all times within -15 to -18 mV. However, the zeta potential is not necessarily as good an indicator of stability for these citrate stabilized AgNPs, as for strictly electrostatically repulsed NPs. Immediately after suspending AgNPs in modified M7, the dissolved Ag was determined to ≤1% of the total measured Ag (Figure 1B). During 24 h aging, the dissolved Ag roughly doubled, and after 26 h (representative of a 2 h pulse exposure), the dissolved fluctuated between 1.5-5% non-dependently of concentration and time (Figure 1B).

During CuONP pulse exposures, the measured copper concentration remained within 92-101% of the nominal. However, the distribution of the CuONPs in the test beakers was found to be affected by sedimentation. The recovery of copper (determined as the measured total copper concentration compared to the nominal concentration) was less in samples drawn from the middle of the suspension without stirring, compared to the samples drawn while stirring, and this difference
increased with CuONP concentration and pulse duration, see Figure 2A. The sedimentation during
pulses was not visible, as suspensions appeared uniform in color, but after 24 and 48 hours of
standard testing, sedimentation was visibly detected as a dark layer on the bottom of test beakers, as
also reported by others (Adam et al., 2015). Adsorption to containers was also visually detected
upon 24 hours as relatively large, dark stains on the inside of plastic flasks used for the aging of
CuONP suspensions (data not included). Thus, the impact of sedimentation and adhesion to
containers on the exposure concentrations are inevitably greater in a standard 24-48 h toxicity test,
compared to the 1-3 hour pulses of CuONPs. The measured zeta potentials of -5 to -13 mV also
point to instability of the CuONP suspensions, and this did not change over 3 hours. According to
DLS measurements, the CuONP agglomerates formed in modified M7 were micron sized, but the
DLS size distribution data was generally of poor quality with a polydispersity index (PDI) of 0.5-
1.0 and inconsistency between detected size peaks and the z-average sizes. Thus, DLS was deemed
inapplicable for providing more detailed information on size distributions over time. The dissolved
fraction released from CuONPs as determined by ultracentrifugation was found to be < 0.5% of the
total measured Cu and remained rather stable within a 1-3 hour pulse period, but increased to 3.5
and 5.5% after 24 and 48 hours, respectively, see figure 2B. The dissolved copper concentration
released from the CuONPs was in the range 0.07-72 µg Cu/L (when subtracting the copper nutrient
in the medium). This dissolved copper concentration decreased with CuONP concentration (Figure
2B), possibly due to the increasing sedimentation with increasing concentration, as also reported by
others (Baek and An, 2011).

Overall, the data is in agreement with the expectation that the influence of agglomeration,
dissolution and sedimentation of AgNPs and CuONPs, is minimized during 1-3 hour pulses,
compared to standard 24-48 h exposures of D. magna, and further for AgNPs, that an aging step is
beneficial for maintaining stable exposure conditions, as also suggested for algal toxicity testing
with AgNPs (Sørensen and Baun, 2015).
The chemical speciation was estimated by Visual MINTEQ for AgNO$_3$ and CuCl$_2$ in modified M7, but not for the tested ENPs as the program is not suited to handle NP specific properties, such as coatings, dissolution, aggregation, surface charge etc. The speciation details for the soluble silver and copper however, provide an indication of the primary chemical species formed from silver and copper in the modified M7 medium. The dominant chemical species are for AgNO$_3$: AgCl$_{aq}$ (64%), AgCl$_2$ (27%), and Ag$^+$ (8%), and for CuCl$_2$: CuCO$_3$$_{aq}$ (65%), CuEDTA$^{2-}$ (13%), CuOH$^+$ (12%), and Cu$^{2+}$ (4%).

### 3.2 Acute toxicity of silver and copper to *D. magna* in pulse and continuous exposures

Both pulse and continuous exposures to the NPs and the soluble salts of silver were found to be more acutely toxic to *D. magna* than copper, see Figure 3. Mean effective concentrations (EC$_{50}$) and 95% confidence intervals for all the curves in Figure 4 are provided in Table 2. For all test materials, the effect level detected 48 h post-exposure from pulse exposures was comparable to the effect level upon 24 h continuous exposures, with EC$_{50}$-values having overlapping 95% confidence intervals. With few exceptions, the 24 and 48 h EC$_{50}$-values from 2 and 3 h pulses were not statistically significant different from those of 24 h continuous exposures, as evidenced by the overlapping 95% confidence intervals. Generally, fewer immobile organisms were observed immediately after the pulse exposures (0 h post-exposure) than after 24 and 48 hours post-exposure observation. This indicates that the organisms were indeed affected by the short-term pulses, although this effect on mobility could not be observed until 24 hours later. The slightly lower acute toxicity of CuONP pulses compared to the continuous exposure indicates a somewhat slower toxicokinetics and/or toxicodynamics than is the case for AgNPs. Ionic silver (Ag$^+$) is known to inhibit the active Na$^+$ uptake by blocking the N$^+$, K$^+$-ATPase, a process shown to occur within 2 hours and be complete within 12 h in *Daphnia magna* (Bianchini and Wood, 2003). The acute toxicity of copper may involve a similar physiological mechanism (Bianchini and Wood, 2003), but also the redox cycling of copper and following generation of reactive oxygen species has been reported as mechanisms involved in cellular toxicity of copper (Thit et al., 2015). In contrast to
silver, copper is an essential metal for cells, and may explain why higher concentrations and/or longer exposure time is needed for toxicity to occur. Moreover, the differences in silver and copper toxicity may relate to the bioavailability differing due to chemical speciation in the medium and/or affinity for the binding site. According to the chemical speciation modeling, the percentage of free ionic Ag⁺ (8%) is twice that of Cu²⁺ (4%) in the modified M7 medium. This correlates well with the higher toxicity of AgNO₃ and AgNPs, although the contribution to toxicity from other chemical species such as CuCO₃, CuOH⁺ and AgClₐq cannot be ruled out (De Schamphelaere and Janssen, 2004; SCENIHR, 2014). Rapid toxicokinetics and toxicodynamics would explain why a few hours pulse exposure to AgNO₃ and CuCl₂ is sufficient to cause the same level of effects as could be observed in the standard 48 h acute toxicity tests with continuous exposure. This trend was also observed for the AgNPs and CuONPs, indicating that the dissolved fraction is governing toxicity. The EC₅₀-values of CuCl₂ were about 100 times lower than for CuONPs and for AgNO₃ the values were about 20 times lower than for AgNPs. The aging step introduced prior to the testing of AgNPs may have influenced this difference as the AgNP suspension had a head start in terms of dissolution compared to tests with freshly prepared CuONP suspensions. However, in tests with CuONPs rapid sedimentation occurred in the test suspensions. This decreased the availability of CuONPs to the daphnids even within the short pulse exposures. For all tested materials the 24 and 48 h EC₅₀-values decreased with increased pulse duration although not statistically significant (p > 0.05). Thus, short-term (1-3 hour) pulse tests were found to be sufficient to disclose the acute toxicity of CuCl₂, CuONPs, AgNO₃ and AgNPs.

3.3 Chronic effects of silver and copper pulses on D. magna mortality, body length and molting

In the 21 days post-exposure period following 1, 2 and 3 hour pulse exposures of the test materials, the mortality observed in the exposed groups was neither concentration nor pulse-duration dependent. (Figure S1). According to the OECD guideline 211 (OECD, 2012), one of the validity criteria is a control mortality of ≤ 20%. In three of the nine tests, a control mortality of 40-50%
occurred (control groups for 1 and 2 hour AgNO$_3$ pulse, and 3 hour CuONPs pulse, respectively).

For the CuONP pulse, this was not reflected by an overall high level of mortality in the exposed groups ($\leq 20\%$), and the results of this test are therefore considered valid. For the AgNO$_3$ tests, high mortalities generally occurred across exposure groups, however the high mortalities in the control groups hamper the interpretation of these mortality results.

The measured body length of surviving mother organisms after 21 days post-exposure did not change as a function of concentration or pulse-duration for any of the test materials (Figure S2). Linear regression slopes were not statistically significant different for data sets obtained after 1, 2 and 3 h pulse exposures ($p < 0.05$). These data sets were pooled and the slopes of linear regression curves of body lengths versus concentration were not statistically significant different from zero for any of the test materials ($p > 0.05$).

The number of moltings per surviving mother organism was not affected by the pulse-duration, however the linear regressions on pooled data indicate a slight decrease in the number of moltings with concentration for CuCl$_2$ and CuONPs, but not for AgNO$_3$ and AgNPs (Figure S2).

### 3.4 Effects of silver and copper pulses on reproduction of *D. magna*

For AgNPs and AgNO$_3$, the time to first live offspring did not change with silver concentration or pulse duration (Figure 4A and B). The number of offspring however, appear to increase slightly with silver concentration (Figure 4E and F), although only statistically significant for the 3 hours pulse exposure to AgNPs ($p < 0.05$). A stimulating effect on the number of offspring has previously been reported for the same type of AgNPs at 10 µg Ag/L in a static renewal setup (Mackevica et al., 2015) and for other citrate-coated AgNPs at 2 µg Ag/L (Pokhrel and Dubey, 2012). This hormetic effect of silver could result from the antibacterial effects of silver causing better conditions for the test organism as also suggested by Mackevica et al. (2015). Other studies have found detrimental effects of AgNPs on the survival, growth and/or reproduction of *D. magna* at 10-50 µg Ag/L.
For AgNO₃, no effects on growth, time to first brood or number of offspring were observed for continuous exposures in concentrations up to 1.6 µg Ag/L during 21 days, but mortality was shown to be affected at 1.6 µg Ag/L (Mackevica et al., 2015; Zhao and Wang, 2011). Overall, the results of the present pulse tests together with published data from tests with continuous exposures suggest that 1-3 h pulses of AgNO₃ and AgNPs, respectively, do not induce chronic effects to the same extent as 21 d continuous exposure.

For CuONP pulses, the data indicate slightly longer time to first offspring for 3 h pulse exposures and pronounced decreases in the number of offspring with copper concentration for all pulse durations (Figure 4C and G). Similarly, for CuCl₂ the number of offspring decreased after 2 and 3 h pulses, whereas the time to offspring was unaffected (or even reduced after 1 h pulse exposure) (Figure 4D and H). Continuous exposure tests (i.e., static renewal tests) with D. magna to the same type of CuONPs and CuCl₂ have been reported to decrease the number of offspring with concentration in the ranges: 0.037-1.4 mg Cu/L (CuONPs) and 0.004-0.060 mg Cu/L (CuCl₂) (Adam et al., 2015). These ranges are comparable to observation made in the present study (Figure 4), however the number of offspring was far more affected in the continuous exposure setup than in our pulse exposure tests, with a 20% reduction or more in the number of offspring at the highest exposure concentrations (Adam et al., 2015). Moreover, a significant decrease in the body lengths was found in the same study at 1.4 and 0.03 mg Cu/L for CuONPs and CuCl₂, respectively (Adam et al., 2015). Another study with continuous exposure (daily renewal) found CuONPs to significantly inhibit both growth and reproduction, at very low concentrations of 0.002 mg Cu/L, but not the time to first brood (Zhao et al., 2012). Thus, a short-term pulse of soluble copper or CuONPs may induce chronic effects, although at higher concentrations than for continuous exposure.
To elucidate whether the effect of CuONP pulses on the number of offspring was caused by dissolved copper, the exposure concentrations of CuONPs in Figure 4G was converted into dissolved copper concentrations based on the dissolution measurements, and compared with the data for CuCl$_2$ in Figure 4H. Since the linear regressions of the number of offspring as a function of the dissolved copper concentrations for 1, 2 and 3 h CuONPs pulses were not statistically significant different with respect to slope and constant term, these data were pooled to simplify the comparison. For CuCl$_2$, pooling of data from 1, 2 and 3 h pulses was not possible due to different slopes and/or elevations. Instead, the data with the steepest slope was used for the comparison (2 h pulse). Comparing the two datasets and the linear regressions (Figure S3), the effects of dissolved Cu from CuONPs were more pronounced than for CuCl$_2$, indicating a nano-specific effect on toxicity or bioavailability. This could relate to the physical dimension of NPs, causing them to accumulate in the gut of the daphnids as result of their filter-feeding behavior. Accumulation in the gut may cause CuONPs to dissolve more readily as result of the environment in the gut, as suggested for AgNPs (Gaiser et al., 2011), but remaining CuO particles in the gut region of the daphnids may also increase the internal exposure beyond the pulse duration. In line with this, higher body burdens of copper have been measured in daphnids exposed to CuONPs, compared to CuCl$_2$ (Adam et al., 2015), although the effects on reproduction in that study were similar for CuCl$_2$ and CuONPs when the results were expressed as dissolved copper.

The OECD guideline no. 211 includes a validity criteria of a mean number of ≥ 60 live offspring produced per surviving mother organism in unexposed control groups after 21 days (OECD, 2012). This criterion was met for four of the twelve tests, short by a few in four tests (1 and 3 h CuCl$_2$, 1 h and 3 h pulse AgNO$_3$) and short by more (a total of 37-49 offspring per daphnid) in the three tests with AgNP pulses. The offspring production was however in the same range as for the pre-culture and because there was a positive effect or no effect on number of offspring in the tests with lowest control reproduction (AgNPs and AgNO$_3$ pulses), this lower production is not assumed to indicate lower fitness of the organisms and thereby have influenced the test outcome.
Overall, the concentrations found to cause immobilization in *D. magna* of both silver forms (AgNO$_3$ and AgNPs) and CuCl$_2$ after 2-3 h pulse exposures were similar to those found for 24 h continuous exposure. For CuONPs the effects of pulses on *D. magna* mobility were slightly lower than those observed after continuous exposure. In contrast, the reproductive effects were most pronounced for CuONPs, whereas exposure to AgNPs in sub-lethal concentrations seemed to slightly stimulate reproduction.

The 1, 2, and 3 h pulses of AgNO$_3$ and AgNPs caused acute effects at concentration levels comparable to what has been reported in the literature for 48 h continuous exposure. Our results showed that if a few hours of exposure to silver do not cause lethality in *D. magna*, then neither delayed mortality nor effects on molting, body length and reproduction are likely to occur. While the toxic mode of action governing acute toxicity of silver is well-known, the mechanism behind reduced offspring production is less clear and may involve transfer of egg yolk protein or simply a diversion of metabolic energy away from reproduction, towards metal detoxification (Wood et al., 2002).
4. Conclusion

This study aimed to investigate the applicability of 1-3 h pulse exposure for stabilizing exposures and disclosing acute and chronic effects of AgNPs, CuONPs, AgNO$_3$ and CuCl$_2$ in *D. magna*. Overall, the impact of dissolution, agglomeration and sedimentation on the stability of ENPs in daphnia test medium was less during 1-3 h, compared to the 24-48 h representative of a standard acute immobility test. The level of immobility observed for *D. magna* 48 h after a short-term pulse exposure (1, 2, and 3 h) to the test materials was generally comparable to the effect levels observed after 24 h continuous exposure. For CuONPs the effects of pulse exposures were slightly lower than for continuous exposure, although not statistically. With regards to chronic effects, the 1-3 h pulses impacted mortality, body length and reproduction less than what is reported in literature for chronic tests with continuous exposures to the same test materials.

Pulse exposure tests with *D. magna* may serve for acute toxicity screening of engineered nanoparticles as they represent environmentally relevant exposure scenarios and enable more stable exposure scenarios to be maintained during the incubation in test medium, than standard continuous exposure tests. Applicability was demonstrated in terms of acute immobility for AgNPs and CuONPs, but pulse exposure tests may very likely be applicable for acute toxicity testing of other very toxic and partly dissolving metal NPs.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Signe Qualmann, Susanne Kruse and Mikael E. Olsson (DTU Environment) for technical assistance. This work is part of the project ENVNANO (Environmental Effects and Risk Evaluation of Engineered Nanoparticles) supported by the European Research Council (grant no. 281579).
References


Cupi, D., Hartmann, N.B., Baun, A., 2015. The Influence of Natural Organic Matter and Aging on
Suspension Stability in Guideline Toxicity Testing of Silver, Zinc Oxide, and Titanium Dioxide Nanoparticles with Daphnia Magna. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 34, 497–506. doi:10.1002/etc.2855


of testing metal and metal oxide nanoparticles in algal bioassays: titanium dioxide and gold
Hartmann, N.B., Jensen, K.A., Baun, A., Rasmussen, K., Rauscher, H., Tantra, R., Cupi, D.,
Nanoparticle Powders in Aqueous Media—Is there a Rationale for Harmonization? J. Toxicol.
Hartmann, N.B., von der Kammer, F., Hofmann, T., Baalousha, M., Ottofuelling, S., Baun, A.,
2010. Algal testing of titanium dioxide nanoparticles-Testing considerations, inhibitory effects
and modification of cadmium bioavailability. Toxicology 269, 190–197.
doi:10.1016/j.tox.2009.08.008
Hoang, T.C., Klaine, S.J., 2008. Characterizing the toxicity of pulsed selenium exposure to Daphnia
models in the european environmental risk assessment of chemicals I: Review of protection
doi:10.1002/ieam.69
Geneva, Switzerland.
in the Environment. Env. Sci Technol 46, 6893–6899. doi:10.1016/B978-0-08-099408-
6.00002-5
silver nanoparticles to Daphnia magna under different feeding conditions. Aquat. Toxicol. 161,
10–16. doi:10.1016/j.aquatox.2015.01.023
OECD, 2012. OECD Guideline for the testing of chemicals. No. 211. Daphnia magna Reproduction


Table 1. Nominal exposure concentration ranges in toxicity tests with *D. magna*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Toxicity test</th>
<th>AgNO₃</th>
<th>AgNPs</th>
<th>CuCl₂</th>
<th>CuONPs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>µg Ag/L</td>
<td>mg Cu/L</td>
<td>µg Ag/L</td>
<td>mg Cu/L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acute effects (24-48 h continuous exposure)</td>
<td>0.38-6.0</td>
<td>16-80</td>
<td>0.01-0.80</td>
<td>0.25-4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acute effects of pulse (1, 2, 3 hour pulses)</td>
<td>0.50-8.0</td>
<td>25-200</td>
<td>0.03-0.80</td>
<td>1.3-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronic effects of pulse (1, 2, 3 hour pulses)</td>
<td>0.20-2.0</td>
<td>10-50</td>
<td>0.01-0.05</td>
<td>0.20-3.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. EC₅₀-values with 95% confidence intervals in brackets for acute immobilization responses occurring after 24 and 48 hours standard continuous exposures, and after 0, 24 and 48 hours post-exposure following 1, 2 and 3 hour pulses to AgNPs, AgNO₃, CuONPs and CuCl₂.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exposure type</th>
<th>AgNPs µg Ag/L</th>
<th>AgNO₃ µg Ag/L</th>
<th>CuONPs mg Cu/L</th>
<th>CuCl₂ mg Cu/L</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Continuous</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,24h</td>
<td>130 [120 ; 150]</td>
<td>4.5 [4.0 ; 5.2]</td>
<td>6.5 [3.7 ; 46]</td>
<td>0.10 [0.080 ; 0.13]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,48h</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>4.0 [n.e.]</td>
<td>5.2 [2.9 ; 25]</td>
<td>0.05* [n.e.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1 h pulse</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,0h post-exposure</td>
<td>290 [200 ; 9700]</td>
<td>8* [n.e.]</td>
<td>130 [31;4.9×10⁸]</td>
<td>1.1 [0.70 ; 4.3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,24h post-exposure</td>
<td>130 [110 ; 150]</td>
<td>6.2 [n.e.]</td>
<td>280 [n.e.]</td>
<td>0.27 [0.21 ; 0.34]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,48h post-exposure</td>
<td>110 [88 ; 140]</td>
<td>5.1 [4.3 ; 6.5]</td>
<td>42 [15 ; 89000]</td>
<td>0.22 [0.036 ; 0.75]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2 h pulse</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,0h post-exposure</td>
<td>150 [130 ; 200]</td>
<td>&gt; 8* [n.e.]</td>
<td>260 [n.e.]</td>
<td>0.34 [n.e.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,24h post-exposure</td>
<td>120 [n.e.]</td>
<td>6.2 [5.2 ; 8.2]</td>
<td>33 [15 ; 520]</td>
<td>0.17 [0.12 ; 0.22]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,48h post-exposure</td>
<td>110 [n.e.]</td>
<td>4.6 [3.7 ; 6.0]</td>
<td>19 [12 ; 66]</td>
<td>0.14 [0.031 ; 0.42]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3 h pulse</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,0h post-exposure</td>
<td>110 [90 ; 130]</td>
<td>9.8 [7.0 ; 27]</td>
<td>43 [17 ; 4800]</td>
<td>0.27 [0.22 ; 0.34]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,24h post-exposure</td>
<td>110 [92 ; 130]</td>
<td>6.4 [5.2 ; 9.1]</td>
<td>22 [12 ; 110]</td>
<td>0.14 [n.e.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC₅₀,48h post-exposure</td>
<td>110 [87 ; 120]</td>
<td>4.3 [3.1 ; 7.0]</td>
<td>17 [11 ; 47]</td>
<td>0.12* [n.e.]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


n.e. Not estimated. Estimation of confidence interval is not possible from data.

*Value determined from linear connection of data points (estimation by TOXCALC not possible).
**Figures**

**Figure 1.** Agglomeration and dissolution of AgNPs in modified M7. A) Mean size of the single size peak detected by DLS for AgNPs in modified M7 (of nominal concentration 200 µg Ag/L) immediately upon preparation (0 h), after aging (24 h), and after pulse exposure (1, 2 and 3 h, respectively). B) Dissolved silver measured in the supernatant of ultracentrifuged AgNP suspensions (of nominal concentrations 10, 50 and 200 µg Ag/L) over time, as % of the total measured Ag concentrations at time 0, 24 and 48 h, respectively.

**Figure 2.** Sedimentation and dissolution of CuONPs in modified M7. A) Measured copper concentration as percent of nominal in CuONP suspensions (1.3 and 20 mg Cu/L) after ended pulse exposures (1, 2 and 3 h) sampled first without stirring from center of suspensions, and then sampled during stirring, yielding the suspended and total copper, respectively. B) Fraction of dissolved copper measured in the supernatant of ultracentrifuged CuONP suspensions (of nominal concentrations 0.2, 2 and 20 mg Cu/L) determined 0, 1, 2, 3, 24 and 48 hours after suspending the CuONPs (shown as percent of the total measured copper concentration at 0 h). All measured Cu concentrations are corrected for the Cu nutrient of the medium.
**Figure 3.** Acute toxicity (immobilization) to *D. magna* of AgNPs, AgNO₃, CuONPs and CuCl₂ (columns 1-4) after 1, 2 and 3 hour pulse exposures (row 1-3) and 48 h standard continuous exposures (bottom row). Data are provided as number of immobile organisms relative to the total number of organisms for each concentration (relative inhibition) along with fitted concentration-response curves estimated with TOXCALC when possible from data. Immobility responses to pulses are shown for 0, 24 and 48 hour post-exposure observation periods. For standard tests, observations made after 24 and 48 hour continuous exposures are shown (for AgNPs only the 24 h data are available). The shaded areas depict the 95% confidence intervals of the EC₅₀, 24h from continuous exposure tests (bottom row).
Figure 4. Reproduction data for *D. magna* in the 21 days post-exposure observation period after 1, 2, and 3 h pulse exposure to AgNPs, AgNO₃, CuONPs and CuCl₂ (columns 1-4). Data are observations made over the 21 days period for each surviving mother organism, along with linear regressions for 1, 2 and 3 h pulses, respectively. Row 1: Days to first live offspring. Row 2: Total number of live offspring produced in the post-exposure period per surviving mother organism. Parameters and statistics for linear regressions are provided in Table S2.